

Proposal Evaluation Summary

Design Services for Kirkwood Roundabout – RFP #PUR0516-200

Proposals opened July 7, 2016

Evaluators: Kevin Vrchoticky, Nate Kampman, John Witt, Matt Myers

Proposals received in alphabetical order:

Firm Name	Location
Ament Design	Cedar Rapids, IA
Anderson Bogert	Cedar Rapids, IA
Bolton & Menk, Inc.	Ames, IA
Hall & Hall Engineers, Inc.	Hiawatha, IA
hbk Engineering	Cedar Rapids, IA
McClure Engineering Co.	North Liberty, IA
Snyder & Associates	Cedar Rapids, IA
YTT Design Solutions	Cedar Rapids, IA

Top four ranked firms:

1. Bolton & Menk, Inc.

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience	540
Proposed Cost (see page 2)	170
Responsiveness	150
Local Preference Points	n/a
Total Evaluation Points	860

Facts:

- Firm possesses all required experience in-house with no need for sub-consultants
- Extensive experience on roundabout projects, including some for schools
- Proposal clearly presents specific roundabout experience of the individual team members who would be assigned to this project
- Financial proposal is within competitive range
- Clear understanding of project with very detailed timeline and proven success on multiple roundabout projects

2. Snyder & Associates

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience	480
Proposed Cost (see page 2)	160
Responsiveness	160
Local Preference Points	50
Total Evaluation Points	850

Facts:

- Local branch of large firm possessing all required experience in-house with no need for sub-consultants
- Firm has extensive roundabout experience, including for schools, and good experience on landscape architecture and lighting
- Roundabout experience is not specifically tied to the individual project team members presented in the proposal
- Financial proposal is within competitive range
- Clear understanding of project and reasonable timeline

3. Anderson Bogert

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience	420
Proposed Cost (see page 2)	180
Responsiveness	140
Local Preference Points	50
Total Evaluation Points	790

Facts:

- Local firm teamed with sub-consultants Confluence, Design Engineers, and Terracon
- Extensive experience working on many City projects
- Firm has some roundabout experience
- Financial proposal is within competitive range
- Clear understanding of project and reasonable timeline

4. Hall & Hall Engineers, Inc.

Criteria	Points
Qualifications and Experience	480
Proposed Cost (see page 2)	120
Responsiveness	140
Local Preference Points	50
Total Evaluation Points	790

Facts:

- Local firm teamed with sub-consultant Kittelson & Associates, a leader in roundabout design
- Currently working with the City on several Paving for Progress projects
- Majority of team experience with roundabouts is with sub-consultant, Kittelson & Associates, who will be reviewing the plans for this project on behalf of the DOT for any consultant who is awarded this project.
- Financial proposal is at high end of competitive range
- Clear understanding of project and detailed timeline; sub-consultant has proven success on multiple roundabout projects

Recommendation for Award:

The evaluation team scored the top ranked proposals and Bolton & Menk, Inc. was rated as the top proposal. A resolution will be presented to the City Council on July 26, 2016 recommending that the contract be awarded to Bolton & Menk.

Financial Submittals:

Firm	Financial Proposal
Ament Design	\$169,084
Anderson Bogert	\$132,000
Bolton & Menk, Inc.	\$137,914
Hall & Hall Engineers, Inc.	\$178,880
hbk Engineering	\$113,190
McClure Engineering Co.	\$275,533
Snyder & Associates	\$142,940
YTT Design Solutions	\$95,088