

MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING,
Thursday, January 8, 2015 @ 4:30 p.m.
Collins Conference Room, City Hall, 101 First Street SE

Members Present: Amanda McKnight-Grafton Chair
Sam Bergus
Bob Grafton
Ron Mussman
Tim Oberbroeckling
Mark Stoffer Hunter
Todd McNall
Caitlin Hartman
Pat Cargin

Members Absent: Barbara Westercamp
B.J. Hobart

City Staff: Jeff Hintz, Planner
Anne Russett, Planner
Kevin Ciabatti, Building Services Director
Anne Kroll, Administrative Assistant

Guests: Cindy Hadish
Chad Hayslett
Jason Bailey
David Bailey

Call Meeting to Order

- Amanda McKnight Grafton called the meeting to order at 4:32 p.m.
- Nine (9) Commissioners were present with two (2) absent.

1. Approve Meeting Minutes

- Tim Oberbroeckling made a motion to approve the minutes from December 11, 2014. Ron Mussman seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Item 2a was requested to be postponed until all members had arrived.

2. Action Items

b. DEMOLITION Applications 1309, 1311, & 1319 C Street SW

- Amanda McKnight-Grafton stated that the Commission could make one motion for all 3 properties if they choose.
- Sam Bergus abstained on all 3 properties.

- Jeff Hintz stated that Penford Plant owns two of the properties and are in the process of acquiring the third at this time. They are being reserved by Penford for future expansion. The 1309 address was built in 1910, 1311 was built in 1920, and 1319 was built in 1910. This area was surveyed in the Citywide Survey and determined to be not eligible. SHPO has verified that all three properties are not eligible for either the State or National Register as a part of the 2009 Reconnaissance Survey by Louis Berger Group. The Assessor noted several functionally obsolete features. Exterior documentation is permissible.
- Mark Stoffer Hunter stated that there are defining historical features on 1311. He recommends documentation at least on the exterior if not the interior as well. The other two properties have been modified. All three were rehabbed after the flood.
- Bob Grafton stated that the inside of 1311 is still intact and 1319 has some features from the 1900-1905 era. Documentation of the inside and outside brings the story full circle.
- Amanda McKnight-Grafton stated that this is a good opportunity for a preview situation to invite Penford to show them that something else can be done besides demolition.

i. 1309 C Street SW – Private Property

- Mark Stoffer Hunter made a motion to approve the demolition of 1309 C Street SW as long as exterior documentation is done. Tim Oberbroeckling seconded the motion. The motion was passed unanimously.

ii. 1311 C Street SW – Private Property

- Mark Stoffer Hunter made a motion to hold the demolition of 1311 C Street SW until exterior and interior documentation can be arranged and further study of the potential of moving the house. Bob Grafton seconded the motion. The motion was passed unanimously.

iii. 1319 C Street SW – Private Property

- Bob Grafton made a motion to hold the demolition of 1319 C Street SW until photo documentation, both exterior and interior, can be arranged and to discuss the potential to move the house. Ron Mussman seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

2.c) Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)

i. 217 Park Court SE – Replacement of windows

- Jeff Hintz stated that at the December HPC meeting the Commission decided to have staff visit to the property. Kevin Ciabatti, Bob Grafton, and Jeff Hintz visited the property. The commission has 3 options: (1) approve as submitted, (2) approve with modifications (ONLY if all changes are agreeable to applicant), and (3) disapprove application (to be used if changes are not agreeable). Staff recommends the second option. Jeff Hintz showed photos of the property from June 2000 so that the Commission could see what the windows looked like previously.
- Amanda McKnight Grafton stated that the Commission will review each side of the house separately and make a recommendation for each.
- Jeff Hintz started with the rear of the house. Staff recommends the upper window jams be painted white on the top floor. The three small windows have not been changed.

- Mark Stoffer Hunter stated that as long as the three small windows stay the same the staff recommendations are fine.
- Jason Bailey is fine with the recommendations for the rear of the house.
- Jeff Hintz went on to the south side of the house. Staff recommends that the window closest to the street and the 2 bay windows next to it be changed to wood windows. All the windows on that side of the house (wood & vinyl) need to be sized to the original opening. The top window and the back window can stay vinyl.
- Chad Hayslett stated that the windows are the same size, but the window sills have been taken out because of rotting and replaced with a piece of wood. The Commission, the applicant, and the contractor discussed the difference between the size of the window vs. the size of the window opening.
- Jason Bailey proposed putting a wooden window on the two bottom windows closest to the street and leaving the rest vinyl, but sizing them to fit the opening.
- Bob Grafton stated that the third bay window can be seen from the street. All three bay windows should be wooden and resized to fit the opening along with the window closest to the street.
- Tim Oberbroeckling made the recommendation to replace the first four windows with wood and have them fit properly into the openings. The top window can stay vinyl since Bob Grafton and Jeff Hintz saw the window in person and the window fits into the opening. The last window can stay vinyl, but needs to be resized.

Todd McNall arrived at 5:09 pm.

- Jason Bailey does not have a problem with the first four windows being wooden and resized, but he does not see why the back window would need to be changed since no one will see it.
- Bob Grafton stated that the only wiggle room on sizing is a $\frac{3}{4}$ of an inch on each side of the window according to the guidelines.
- Jeff Hintz showed the alley side of the house. Staff recommends that the three windows closest to the street be wood and resized to the original opening. The rear window can be vinyl, but needs to be resized to the original opening.
- Chad Hayslett stated that he didn't know he was in a historic district when the windows were replaced and the window sills were taken out.
- Kevin Ciabatti stated that had they applied for the building permit they would have been told the property was in a historic district and that they needed to go to the Commission before the permit was issued.
- Todd McNall stated that one of the things he is having a hard time with is the inconsistency of how the windows look all over the house.
- Tim Oberbroeckling recommended that the windows all need to fit with the front three windows replaced with wood and the back window can be vinyl to be consistent with the other side of the house.
- Chad Hayslett stated that the quote that was received to replace the windows will not work for what the Commission is recommending to be done. The bid that was received was to replace all windows with wood.
- Todd McNall stated that the issue is that the sills were taken out and not replaced as they were. This is a historical feature that should have stayed.
- Jason Bailey does not yet want to agree to the recommendations until he get quotes on the exact work that is being recommended by the Commission. Jason Bailey asked what would happen if he didn't agree with the Commission's recommendations.

- Jeff Hintz explained that the Commission can make a motion to deny the project and at that point a letter would be sent that states that you have 10 days to appeal to the City Council. If you didn't go to City Council then you would be in violation for not receiving the Certificate of Appropriateness and you could end up in court with fines.
- Jason Bailey was under the impression that this would be approved or the other option of the bid that was received would be approved. That bid is no longer an option so he does not know what he is agreeing to.
- Anne Russett stated that staff had requested, as part of the application, to provide bids on what it would cost to replace all of the windows with wood. Sixteen windows had been replaced with vinyl. The bid is what it would cost to have the windows replaced with wood. That is a requirement as part of the application and not part of any decision that the Commission has made.
- Todd McNall stated that the historic integrity of the exterior of the house was compromised. Those windows should have been replaced within the original rough openings without taking the sills out.
- Tim Oberbroeckling recommended that the Commission go through all sides of the house and tell Mr. Bailey what needs to be done so that he could get a price and make a decision.
- Jeff Hintz stated that another option is to table this item until Mr. Bailey can get the bids as long as he understands that the Commission is speaking about the entire window opening and not just the glass area.
- Amanda McKnight Grafton recommended that the bid have a picture of each window and have them labeled, so that the bid is clear.
- Jeff Hintz showed the front of the house. Staff recommended that all of the windows be wood and to fit to the original opening.
- Todd McNall suggested that all of the sills should be rebuilt due to the historic nature of them.
- Tim Oberbroeckling recommended that the Commission follow the guidelines on the front. They should all be wood and sized to fit.
- Bob Grafton stated that the top front window is actually two separate windows and not one. This is a distinctive feature that should not be changed.
- Amanda McKnight Grafton stated that the top window needs to be changed back to two windows and they need to be wood. The center jam needs to be there.
- Bob Grafton stated that the first floor window needs to be wood.
- Tim Oberbroeckling made a motion to table this item so that Mr. Bailey has the opportunity to get bids on the Commission's recommendations and to decide if he would like to proceed in getting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the window project. Mark Stoffer Hunter seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

3. New Business

a. National Register Nominations – Averill House and Grant Vocational High School

- Jeff Hintz stated that the nominations were done privately. The property owners of each property requested to be designated to the National Register of Historic Places. The Commission gets the opportunity to comment on all National Register nominations in its boundaries. The SHPO has sent comment forms to Amanda McKnight Grafton (as chair) to ask if the Commission would recommend each of these properties for listing of the National Register. This will be on the City Council agenda at the end of the month to either support or not support both of these properties.

- Todd McNall made a motion to support both applications. Tim Oberbroeckling seconded the motion.

i. Averill, Glenn M. & Edith House – 616 4th Avenue SE

- Mark Stoffer Hunter stated that the Averill House has been moved and is not on its original foundation. It is not at the height elevation it was before and some historians have an issue with that.
- Todd McNall made a motion to support the Averill, Glenn M. & Edith House application. Tim Oberbroeckling seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

ii. Grant Vocational High School – 346 2nd Avenue SW

- Sam Bergus stated that Grant Vocational High School has changed window openings and changed window material.
- Mark Stoffer Hunter stated that there were major changes made to the two front entrances and one entrance is gone.
- Bob Grafton stated that the nomination is not for architecture in criteria C.
- Tim Oberbroeckling stated that even though it has different windows and a different entryway it is structurally sound and still has a historical look to it.
- Todd McNall stated that the windows have been changed but if you look at the brick work and the stone work the window has not been changed in size.
- Amanda McKnight Grafton stated that this vocational school is one of the first of its kind and it has been repurposed. They are going for criteria A not criteria C.
- Mark Stoffer Hunter stated that this is the first time in Cedar Rapids' history to have a former school building on the National Register. It sets a good precedent that school buildings can be on the National Register of Historic Places.
- Jeff Hintz stated that the owner would like to rehab this property as residential and use tax credits and thinks this designation would help this project pass. If not, this building would sit vacant and become rundown putting it on the demolition list.
- Todd McNall made a motion to support the Grant Vocational High School application. Tim Oberbroeckling seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

3.b) Section 106 Review – Communications tower near 3rd Street SE and 12th Avenue SE

- Jeff Hintz stated that he met with the citizens and industry professionals four different times from August to November. Jeff has done presentations to City Council, Development Committee, and Planning Commission and it was recommended every time for advancement. The recommended changes are tower placement based on distance from existing residential and a tiered system to determine the following: height of tower, notification requirements, materials used in construction of facility, and project approval for number of reviews and length. If everything goes well at Council then those adoptions will become laws. Jeff Hintz showed a photo of what it would look like.
- Todd McNall stated that Main Street did not have any negative comments.
- Ann Poe stated that Jeff and his team that worked with the providers and community partners have been working on this for quite a while and have put a lot of time and energy into this.
- Tim made the motion to make no comment on the communications tower near 3rd Street SE and 12th Avenue SE. Todd McNall seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

4. Old Business

a. Preservation Showcase Subcommittee Updates

- No Updates

4.b) 3rd Street & 12 Avenue SE Kiosk

- Anne Russett stated that this is an update on the kiosk. This has been to the Commission many times. A vote is needed either tonight or in the future regarding this project because the MOA requires that the design, content, and location of the kiosk be approved by the Historic Preservation Commission among other reviewing bodies. Anne Russett showed the design, content and location of the kiosk to the Commission to review.
- Amanda McKnight Grafton talked about the long term care and maintenance of the kiosk.
- Anne Russett stated that as part of the bid request we are asking the consultant to build a brick paving area so there won't be any weeds or grass around the kiosk.
- Mark Stoffer Hunter has to abstain.
- Tim Oberbroeckling made a motion to approve the kiosk design with no wires, the proposed location location as long as there is brick work underneath the kiosk and centered under the light post, and the proposed panel design with the P. Hach Building picture in line with the rest of the pictures in that row. Todd McNall seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Item 2a was proposed next since it is the last voting item.

2.a) Annual Chair, Vice Chair and Secretary Selections

- Jeff Hintz stated that it is in the bylaws to have the election at the first meeting of the year.
- Tim Oberbroeckling asked Amanda McKnight Grafton if she would like to stay on as chair, Todd McNall as Vice Chair, and Bob Grafton as Secretary and they all said yes.
- Tim Oberbroeckling made a motion to continue with the current Chair, Vice Chair and Secretary. Pat Cargin seconded the motion. Todd McNall, Amanda McKnight Grafton and Bob Grafton all abstained. The motion passed unanimously.

4.c.) Central Fire Station Digital Display

- Anne Russett stated that this was sent out via email in December for the Commission to review and provide comment. At the last meeting, the Commission reviewed the content. The display has four different items including the history of the new Central Fire station, history of the Lincoln Highway, Automobile Row, and the Fire Department. The display will be inside the museum at the Central Fire Station.
- The Commission is interested in having this information online since the content is so large. It would be hard to stand at the fire station for a long time to read it all and watch the included video.
- Mark Stoffer Hunter asked if more pictures and content could be added or edits could be made after it is set up. Staff will find out.

5. MOA/LOA Project Updates

- No updates

6. Good of the Group

- No Comments

7. Adjournment

- Tim Oberbroeckling made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 6:44 PM. Sam Bergus seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Respectfully Submitted,

Anne Kroll, Administrative Assistant II
Community Development